

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2014) KLR VOL 1 PART 340 pp. 241 - 474

JANUARY 2014

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Founder/Publisher

C. L. Onwuegbuna Esq. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

JANUARY CONTD.

7. Aminu v. Hassan p. 249
8. Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281
9. Integration Nig. Ltd. v. Zumafon Nig. Ltd. p. 311
10. Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325
11. Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357
12. Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

242 INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2014) 1 KLR

APPEALS - Court - Abuse of process - Leave granted 1st respondent to appeal against decision of FHC - On subject matter that has been dismissed by SC - Is gross abuse of process (H12) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 353

APPEALS - Court - Discretion - Exercise of - Supreme Court rarely interferes with discretion exercised by lower courts - Save where such exercise was based on extraneous issues - Or was not bona fide (H2) *Integration Nig. Ltd. v. Zumafon Nig. Ltd.* p. 311

APPEALS - Court - Discretion - Interference - For appellate court to interfere with exercise of discretion - It must be shown that the discretion was based on wrong principles of law - Or that miscarriage of justice resulted (H15) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Courts - Facts - Consideration - Court has duty to holistically consider all relevant facts presented before it - As revealed on the records of appeal (H5) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Election petitions - Court of Appeal - Jurisdiction - By the nature of relief (b) on Exhibit E - CA ought to be put on guard that the subject matter of the appeal - Was not within its jurisdiction (H10) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Election petitions - Gubernatorial - Final court - By 1999 Constitution s. 235 - Decision of SC is final in such election matters - And CA is duty bound by s. 287 to give effect to judgments of SC (H7) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Evidence - Evaluation - Where trial court unquestionably evaluates evidence - CA cannot interfere once there is sufficient evidence on record - From which trial court arrived at its findings of facts (H1) *Gbileve v. Addingi* p. 281

APPEALS - Grounds - Objection - The preliminary objection is misconceived - As the grounds having raised the issue of jurisdiction of court - Is purely of law and competent (H3) *Okorocha v. Peoples*

Democratic Party p. 357

APPEALS - Judgment - Unchallenged - As appellant did not challenge the crucial findings on the merit of the appeal - The Orders made by Court of Appeal subsist (H7) *Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 413

APPEALS - Objection - Unchallenged - Facts on which objections were based in CA were not controverted - Being unchallenged evidence - They constitute sufficient proof (H6) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Preliminary objection - Determination - The objection must first be considered and resolved once raised - As it could either end proceeding - Or streamline it down by excluding factors which may not be legitimately accommodated (H1) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Preliminary objection - Filing - By SC Rules O. 2 r. 9(1) respondent relying on the objection - Shall give appellant three clear days notice - Setting out the grounds of objection - And shall file such notice together with ten copies thereof (H4) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Right of appeal - Election petitions - Estoppel - The appeal is caught by lapse of time under 1999 Constitution s. 285(7) - As 1st respondent who had challenged the election up to SC - Can no longer re-litigate his case as pre-election matter at CA (H9) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

APPEALS - Right of appeal - Grounds of law - Appeal from final or interlocutory decision of CA to SC is as of right - Where the ground involves question of law alone (H2) *Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party* p. 357

COURTS - Abuse of process - Prevention - To ensure the authority and dignity of court - Court is imbued with power and duty to prevent action - Which constitutes abuse of its process (H13) *Okorocha*

v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

COURTS - Counter claim - Validity of - Where loosely framed by counsel to detriment of appellants - CA rightly held that same is unknown to law - And that order made in respect of the claim should be set aside (H8) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

ELECTION PETITIONS - Party - Joinder of - Interested party may be joined very early or midstream in suit - But 1st respondent who knew of the concluded petition by SC - Is estopped from initiating fresh appeal in respect of the supplementary governorship election (H14) Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

ELECTIONS - Political party - Nomination - Right of - Membership or sponsorship of candidate at election is internal affairs of the party - And therefore not justiciable (H4) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

ELECTIONS - Political party - Substitution of candidate - Electoral Act s. 34 - INEC must be informed in writing not later than 60 days to election - And the party must give cogent and verifiable reasons for the change - Except in the case of death or withdrawal (H5) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

ELECTIONS - Pre-election matter - Jurisdiction - By Electoral Act s. 87(9) - Benue State HC did not have jurisdiction to determine all issues on the primaries - Including granting injunction to restrain INEC - From recognizing 1st appellant as successful candidate (H3) Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281

ELECTIONS - Pre-election matter - Justiciability - Electoral Act s. 87(9) - For the complaint to be justiciable - Complainant must be an aspirant who participated in the primary - That produced the sponsored candidate (H6) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - Previous evidence - Alade v. Aborishade - Evidence given in previous case can never be accepted by court trying a later case - Where Evidence Ordinance s. 34(1) applies (H3)

Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

FAIR HEARING - Breach - Allegation of - Appellant's allegation of not having fair hearing at CA cannot be sustained - Since he had the opportunity in SC - To redress any anomaly done in the lower court (H3) Integration Nig. Ltd. v. Zumafon Nig. Ltd. p. 311

FAIR HEARING - Breach - Allegation of - The circumstances in the case show that appellant's right to fair hearing was not breached - As the court ensured that justice was done to both sides (H2) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

FAIR HEARING - Breach - Effect - Proceedings conducted in breach of a party's right to fair hearing - Would be rendered a nullity - No matter how well conducted (H1) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

JUDGMENTS - Previous judgment - Use - Judgment in earlier case is used in a later case on a plea of res judicata - Provided incidents necessary to support such plea are fully observed (H4) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

JURISDICTION - Federal HC - 1999 Constitution s. 251(1)(r) - Relief 5 directly affects INEC - And the section vests exclusive jurisdiction on FHC - To entertain actions affecting validity of executive acts of such Federal Govt. agencies (H2) Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281

JURISDICTION - Fundamentality of - Absence of jurisdiction robs court of power to adjudicate on a case - And exercise arising from such will be in futility (H11) Okorochoa v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

LAND LAW - Appeals - Fresh issue - Raised without leave - Appellant not having sought and obtained leave - Cannot be allowed to raise in SC issue of absence of witnesses - Since the same was not raised in the lower courts (H2) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Customary sale - Evidence of - Exhibit A is memoran-

dum of customary sale of the land - Which transferred to appellant - All 2nd respondent's customary interests (H1) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Customary sale - Governor's consent - 2nd respondent's customary interest does not conflict with L.U.A. s. 22 - And Exhibit A having transferred the interest to appellant - Does not require Governor's consent for its execution (H5) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Customary title - Certificate of Occupancy - It is for holder of such title to land in urban area to apply to the Governor under L.U.A. ss. 5(1) & 9(1) - To have issued to him a C of O of the land (H6) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Customary transfer - Incidence of - Appellant cannot be heard to challenge his being put in possession - As this is evident by the slaughtering of goat on the land - Which symbolizes transfer of possession in customary law (H3) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Evidence - Estoppel - Application - Exhibit E is inadmissible and cannot bind respondents as estoppel - As they were not party to it (H5) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

LAND LAW - Legal practitioner - Duty - Proof - Appellant failed to discharge the onus of showing - That 1st respondent has not acted as solicitor to 2nd respondent in the land deal (H9) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Possession - Proof - Exhibit A as document is the best evidence of its contents - And provides criterion for assessing any oral evidence - With regard to evidence of having put appellant in possession (H4) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Proof - Possession - Appellants by failing to prove that respondents are their customary tenants - Have raised presumption of ownership in favour of respondents - As provided by Evidence Act s. 146 (H7) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2014) 1 KLR 247

LAND LAW - Title - Assignment - L.U.A. s. 22 - Application of - Governor's consent is required under the section - When C of O has been granted and the holder desires to transfer the land - That is subject of the certificate (H7) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

LAND LAW - Trespass - Right of action - Appellant being in exclusive possession can maintain action in trespass - Against any trespasser who cannot claim possession by mere entry (H8) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

PLEADINGS - Binding nature of - Issues are settled on pleadings - And evidence in respect of facts not pleaded must not be allowed - But where inadvertently received - Court must discountenance it (H2) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

PLEADINGS - Purpose of - Is to give notice to the other party of the case he is to meet - And each party is to clearly present his case - In order to prevent any party from being taken by surprise (H1) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

POLITICS - Election - Political party - Substitution of candidate - Properly nominated candidate should not be whimsically substituted - Otherwise he has right to go to court - And if court is unable to rule before actual election takes place - He can be declared winner (H4) Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281

RES JUDICATA - Principle of - It states that final judgment of court on merits is conclusive - As to rights of parties and their privies - And constitutes bar to a subsequent action involving same claim or cause of action (H6) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

STATUTES - Interpretation - Principle - Where words used in statutes are clear and unambiguous - They must be given their natural and grammatical meaning - Unless it would lead to absurdity (H3) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

STAY OF EXECUTION - Grant - Condition - Party seeking for stay of

execution against successful adversary - Must show substantial reasons to justify denial of the latter - Of the fruit of his judgment (H1) Integration Nig. Ltd. v. Zumafon Nig. Ltd. p. 311

SUPREME COURT - Judgment - Supremacy of - By 1999 Constitution s. 287(1) - All subordinate courts in Nigeria are enjoined to enforce all decisions of SC - Otherwise it will amount to constitutional breach (H8) Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999 (as amended), ss. 233, 235, 285(1)(2)(7), 287(1) Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999 (as amended), s. 36(1) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999, ss. 153, 251(i)(r) Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281

Court of Appeal Rules 2011, O. 7 r. 1, O. 18 r. 9 (4), O. 20 r. 3 Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

Electoral Act 2010 (as amended), s. 87(4)(9) Ukachukwu v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 413

Electoral Act 2010 (as amended), ss. 26(1)(2)(3), 133(1), 134(3) Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357

Electoral Act 2010 (as amended), ss. 87(4)(9) Gbileve v. Addingi p. 281

Evidence Act, s. 146 Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

Evidence Ordinance, s. 34(1) Aminu v. Hassan p. 249

Land Use Act 1978, ss. 1, 5(1), 9(1), 22, 26, 34(7) Mbanefo v. Agbu p. 325

Supreme Court Rules, O. 2 rr. 9(1)(2) Okorocha v. Peoples Democratic Party p. 357